

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10083951 3

CASES AND MATERIALS ON  
THE LAW OF TRUSTS

VOLUME II

Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

CASES AND MATERIALS ON  
THE LAW OF TRUSTS

VOLUME II

by  
*Albert*  
Professor A.H. Oosterhoff

Faculty of Law  
The University of Western Ontario

----- FIRST EDITION, 1972  
First Printing, 1972  
SECOND EDITION, 1973  
First Printing, 1973  
THIRD EDITION, 1974  
First Printing, 1974  
FOURTH EDITION, 1979  
First Printing, 1979



## CHAPTER VI - CHARITABLE TRUSTS

1. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	451
Note . . . . .	451
2. WHAT IS CHARITY? . . . . .	451
Note . . . . .	451
Statute of Charitable Uses (Preamble) 43 Eliz. 1,	
c.4 (1601) . . . . .	452
Commissioners for Special Purposes of the Income Tax	
v. Pemsel [1891] A.C. 531 (H.L.) . . . . .	453
Note . . . . .	454
The Mortmain and Charitable Uses Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.	
280, s. 1 (2) . . . . .	454
3. SPECIFIC CHARITABLE PURPOSES . . . . .	455
(a) Relief of Poverty . . . . .	455
Note . . . . .	455
Re Scarisbrick, [1951] 1 Ch. 622 (C.A.) . . . . .	455
Dingle v. Turner, [1972] 1 All E.R. 878	
(H.L.) . . . . .	460
Note . . . . .	463
Jones v. The T. Eaton Co. Ltd. (1973), 35	
D.L.R. (3d) 97 (S.C.C.) . . . . .	464
Questions . . . . .	467
(b) Advancement of Religion . . . . .	467
Note . . . . .	467
Thornton v. Howe (1862), 54 E.R. 1042 . . . . .	468
Gilmour v. Coats, [1949] A.C. 426 (H.L.) . . . . .	470
Re Hallisy, [1932] 4 D.L.R. 516 (Ont. C.A.) . . . . .	476
Problems . . . . .	477
(c) Advancement of Education . . . . .	478
Note . . . . .	478
(i) Particular Forms of Education . . . . .	478
Inland Revenue Commissioners v.	
McMullen, [1978] 1 All E.R.	
230 (Ch.) . . . . .	478
Re Hopkins' Will Trusts, [1965]	
1 Ch. 669 . . . . .	482
Incorporated Council of Law	
Reporting for England and	
Wales v. A.G., [1972] 1 Ch.	
73 (C.A.) . . . . .	484
Royal Choral Society v. Commissioners	
of Inland Revenue, [1943] 2	
All E.R. 101 . . . . .	488
Re Pinion, [1965] 1 Ch. 85 (C.A.) . . . . .	491
Problem . . . . .	493
(ii) The Public Benefit Element . . . . .	493
Oppenheim v. Tobacco Securities	
Trust Co. Ltd., [1951] A.C.	
297 (H.L.) . . . . .	493
Question . . . . .	496
Inland Revenue Commissioners v.	
Educational Grants Association	
Ltd., [1966] 1 Ch. 123 . . . . .	496
(d) Other Purposes Beneficial To the Community . . . . .	499
Note . . . . .	499
(i) Trusts for Political Purposes . . . . .	499
Note . . . . .	499
Bowman v. Secular Society Ltd.,	
[1917] A.C. 406 . . . . .	499
National Anti-Vivisection Society v.	
Inland Revenue Commissioners,	
[1948] A.C. 31 (H.L.) . . . . .	501
Problem . . . . .	508
Note . . . . .	509



(ii) Advancement of Health and Medicine . . . . .	509
Re Resch's Will Trusts, [1969]	
1 A.C. 514 . . . . .	509
(iii) Social and Recreational Trusts . . . . .	513
Williams' Trustees v. Inland	
Revenue Commissioners, [1947]	
A.C. 447 (H.L.) . . . . .	513
Inland Revenue Commissioners v.	
Baddeley, [1955] A.C. 572	
(H.L.) . . . . .	517
Note . . . . .	523
(iv) Other Trusts . . . . .	524
Incorporated Council of Law Reporting	
for England and Wales v. A.G.,	
[1972] 1 Ch. 73 (C.A.) . . . . .	524
Note . . . . .	526
4. THE TRUST MUST BE WHOLLY CHARITABLE . . . . .	526
Note . . . . .	526
Chichester Diocesan Fund & Board of Finance v.	
Simpson, [1944] A.C. 341 (H.L.) . . . . .	526
Note . . . . .	534
Model Wills Act, Unif. Law Conf. of Canada,	
Consolidation of Uniform Acts (1978), p. 53-9 . . . .	534
Problem . . . . .	534
Blais v. Touchet, [1963] S.C.R. 358 . . . . .	535
Note . . . . .	537
Re Delaney (1957), 10 D.L.R. (2d) 213 (B.C.S.C.) . . . .	537
Problem . . . . .	538
Neville Estates Ltd. v. Madden, [1962] 1 Ch. 832 . . . .	538
Note . . . . .	542
5. CHARITIES AND THE RULE AGAINST PERPETUITIES . . . . .	542
Note . . . . .	542
6. CY-PRES . . . . .	544
References . . . . .	544
Note . . . . .	544
(a) Initial Failure . . . . .	545
Re Ulverston Hospital Fund, [1956] 3 All	
E.R. 164 (C.A.) . . . . .	545
Re Harwood, [1936] Ch. 285 . . . . .	550
(b) Subsequent Failure . . . . .	552
Re Gordon, [1965] 2 O.R. 805 (H.C.) . . . . .	552
Re Hunter (1973), 34 D.L.R. (3d) 602	
(B.C.S.C.) . . . . .	555
(c) Impossibility or Impracticability . . . . .	556
Re Weir Hospital, [1910] 2 Ch. 124 (C.A.) . . . .	556
Note . . . . .	559
Re Dominion Students' Hall Trust, [1947]	
1 Ch. 183 . . . . .	559
Re Lysaght, [1966] Ch. 191 . . . . .	560
Note . . . . .	565
7. THE ADMINISTRATION OF CHARITIES . . . . .	566
Note . . . . .	566
The Charities Accounting Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.63 . . . . .	567
The Charitable Gifts Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.61 . . . . .	570
The Mortmain and Charitable Uses Act, R.S.O. 1970,	
c.280 . . . . .	572

## CHAPTER VII - NON-CHARITABLE PURPOSE TRUSTS

References . . . . .	576
Note . . . . .	576

1. ASCERTAINABLE BENEFICIARIES . . . . .	576
Re Astor's Settlement Trusts, [1952] 1 Ch. 534 . . . . .	576
Re Endacott, [1960] 1 Ch. 232 (C.A.) . . . . .	582
Note on Re Shaw, [1957] 1 W.L.R. 729 (Ch.) . . . . .	585
Re Denley's Trust Deed, [1969] 1 Ch. 373 . . . . .	586
2. UNINCORPORATED ASSOCIATIONS . . . . .	589
Note . . . . .	589
Re Recher's Will Trusts, [1972] 1 Ch. 526 . . . . .	590
Re Lipinski's Will Trusts, [1977] 1 All E.R. 33 (Ch.) . . . . .	593
3. PERPETUITIES . . . . .	597
Note . . . . .	597
Note . . . . .	598
The Perpetuities Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.434, s.16 . . . . .	599
Re Russell, [1977] 1 E.T.R. 285 (Alta. S.C.) . . . . .	599

#### CHAPTER VIII - LIMITATIONS ON SETTLOR'S POWER OF DISPOSITION

Note . . . . .	604
1. OBJECTS WHICH ARE ILLEGAL, IMMORAL OR CONTRARY TO PUBLIC POLICY . . . . .	604
Note . . . . .	604
Occleston v. Fullalove (1874), 9 Ch. App. 147 . . . . .	604
2. RESTRAINTS ON ALIENATION, FORFEITURE CLAUSES . . . . .	607
References . . . . .	607
Note . . . . .	607
Brandon v. Robinson (1811), 18 Ves. 429, 34 E.R. 379 . . . . .	607
Rochford v. Hackman (1852), 9 Hare 475, 68 E.R. 597 . . . . .	608
Note . . . . .	610
The Trustee Act, 1925 (U.K.) 15 & 16 Geo. 5, c.19 s.33 . . . . .	610
3. TRUSTS TO DEFRAUD CREDITORS AND CLAIMANTS IN BANKRUPTCY . . . . .	611
Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. B-3, ss. 69, 70, 71 . . . . .	611
Fraudulent Conveyances Act, R.S.O 1970, c.182, ss. 1-8 . . . . .	612
Vaisey v. Kreutzweiser (1965), 8 C.B.R. (N.S.) 225 . . . . .	613
4. TRUSTS WHICH CONTRAVENE RULES OF LAW . . . . .	618
(a) Rule Against Perpetuities . . . . .	618
(b) Rule Against Accumulations . . . . .	618

#### CHAPTER IX - REVOCATION, TERMINATION, VARIATION

1. REVOCATION BY SETTLOR . . . . .	619
(a) Trusts for the Benefit of Creditors . . . . .	619
Note . . . . .	619
Bill v. Cureton (1835), 2 My & K. 503, 39 E.R. 1036 . . . . .	619
(b) Other Cases . . . . .	620
Note . . . . .	620
2. TERMINATION BY BENEFICIARY . . . . .	620
Note . . . . .	620
Re McCrossan (1961), 28 D.L.R. (2d) 461 (B.C.S.C.) . . . . .	621
Re Smith, [1928] 1 Ch. 915 . . . . .	623
Halifax School for the Blind v. Chipman, [1937] 3 D.L.R. 9 (S.C.C.) . . . . .	624

3. VARIATION OF TRUSTS . . . . .	631
References . . . . .	631
Note . . . . .	631
Variation of Trusts Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.477 ss. 1-2 . . . .	631
Note . . . . .	632
(a) General Principles . . . . .	632
Re Steed's Will Trusts, [1960] 1 Ch. 407	
(C.A.) . . . . .	632
Note . . . . .	635
Re Tweedie (1975), 64 D.L.R. (3d) 569	
(B.C.S.C.) . . . . .	635
Re Irving (1975), 66 D.L.R. (3d) 387	
(Ont. H.C.) . . . . .	637
(b) Variation of Investment Powers . . . . .	644
Note . . . . .	644
Re Kiely, [1972] 1 O.R. 845 (H.C.) . . . . .	644
(c) Variations to Meliorate Taxes . . . . .	645
Note . . . . .	645
Re Weston's Settlements, [1969] 1 Ch. 223	
(C.A.) . . . . .	645
Note . . . . .	648

## CHAPTER X - THE ADMINISTRATION OF TRUSTS

1. APPOINTMENT, RETIREMENT, AND REMOVAL OF TRUSTEES . . . . .	649
(a) Appointment of Trustees . . . . .	649
Note . . . . .	649
The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470 ss. 3-16 . . . .	649
Note on Re Tempest (1866), L.R. 1 Ch. App.	
484 . . . . .	653
(b) Retirement of Trustees . . . . .	653
Note . . . . .	653
The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470 s.2 . . . . .	653
(c) Removal of Trustees . . . . .	654
Note . . . . .	654
The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470 s.37 . . . .	654
Re Moorhouse, [1946] O.W.N. 789 . . . . .	655
Conroy v. Stokes, [1952] 4 D.L.R. 124	
(B.C.C.A.) . . . . .	656
Re Consiglio Trusts (No. 1) (1973), 36 D.L.R.	
(3d) 658 (Ont. C.A.) . . . . .	658
Note . . . . .	659
Note . . . . .	659
2. GENERAL POWERS AND DUTIES OF TRUSTEES . . . . .	659
(a) Conflict of Interest and Duty . . . . .	659
Note . . . . .	659
(b) General Standard of Care . . . . .	660
Note . . . . .	660
Fales v. Canada Permanent Trust Co. (1976),	
70 D.L.R. (3d) 257 . . . . .	661
Waters, "Comment" (1977), 55 Can. Bar Rev.	
343 . . . . .	671
(c) Other Powers and Duties; Interference with	
Trustees' Discretion . . . . .	683
Note . . . . .	683
Tempest v. Lord Camoys (1882), 21 Ch. D.	
571 (C.A.) . . . . .	683
Klug v. Klug, [1918] 2 Ch. 67 . . . . .	684
The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470 s.61 . . . .	685
Re Wright (1977), 74 D.L.R. (3d) 504 . . . . .	685
Note . . . . .	690



3. INVESTMENT OF TRUST FUNDS . . . . .	690
Note . . . . .	690
The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470, ss. 26-32,	
68, 69 . . . . .	691
Note . . . . .	693
Re Harari's Settlement Trusts, [1949] 1 All E.R. 430 . .	694
Note . . . . .	695
Note . . . . .	695
Learoyd v. Whiteley (1887), 12 App. Cas. 727 (H.L.) . .	695
Re Gamble (1925), 57 O.L.R. 504 . . . . .	699
The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470, s.21 . . . . .	700
Khoo Tek Keong v. Ch'Ng Joo Tuan Neoh, [1934] A.C.	
529 (P.C.) . . . . .	700
4. DUTY NOT TO DELEGATE; USE OF AGENTS . . . . .	702
Note . . . . .	702
Speight v. Gaunt (1883), 9 App. Cas. 1 (H.L.) . . . .	702
Note on Fry v. Tapson (1845), L.R. 28 Ch. D. 268 . . .	705
The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470, s.20 . . . . .	705
Note on the liability of agents (Barnes v. Addy (1874),	
L.R. 9 Ch. App. 244 (C.A.)) . . . . .	706
5. TRUSTEE'S DUTY TO ACCOUNT AND PROVIDE INFORMATION . .	706
(a) Duty to Account . . . . .	706
The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470, s.23 . . .	706
Sandford v. Porter (1889), 16 O.A.R. 565	
(C.A.) . . . . .	707
(b) Duty to Provide Information . . . . .	708
Note . . . . .	708
Re Londonderry's Settlement, [1965] 1 Ch.	
918 (C.A.) . . . . .	709
6. TRUSTEE'S DUTY TO BE IMPARTIAL . . . . .	712
(a) Generally . . . . .	712
Note . . . . .	712
Re Smith, [1971] 1 O.R. 584 (H.C.) . . . . .	712
(b) The Rule in Howe v. Earl of Dartmouth (1802), 7	
Ves. 137, 32 E.R. 56, and Related Rules . . . . .	716
Notes on Duties to Convert and Apportion . . . .	716
Re Parry, [1947] 1 Ch. 23 . . . . .	718
Re Lauer and Stekl (1974), 47 D.L.R. (3d)	
286 (B.C.C.A.) . . . . .	724
Note . . . . .	727
Royal Trust Co. v. Crawford, [1955] S.C.R.	
184 . . . . .	727
Re Waters, [1956] S.C.R. 889 . . . . .	733
Note . . . . .	736
Re Fleming (1973), 37 D.L.R. (3d) 512 . . . . .	736
Comment (1973-74), 1 Est. & Tr. Q. 105 . . . .	738
(c) The Rule in Allhusen v. Whittell (1867), 4	
L.R. Eq. Cas. 295 . . . . .	744
Note . . . . .	744
The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470, s.49 . . .	745
(d) Other Apportionment Questions . . . . .	745
Note . . . . .	745
7. PAYMENT AND INDEMNITY OF TRUSTEES . . . . .	746
(a) Payment of Trustees . . . . .	746
Note . . . . .	746
The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470, s.62 . . .	746
Re Atkinson, [1952] O.R. 685 (C.A.) . . . . .	746
Note . . . . .	751
(b) Indemnity of Trustees . . . . .	752
Note . . . . .	752
The Trustees Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470,	
ss. 33, 34 . . . . .	752
Wise v. Perpetual Trustee Co. Ltd., [1903]	
A.C. 139 (P.C.) . . . . .	752

Hardoon v. Belilios, [1901] A.C. 118	
(P.C.) . . . . .	754
Thompson v. Lamport, [1945] S.C.R. 343 . . . . .	756
Note . . . . .	759

## CHAPTER XI - BREACH OF TRUST

1. TRUSTEES' LIABILITY TO THE BENEFICIARIES . . . . .	760
Note . . . . .	760
Robinson v. Robinson (1851), 1 De G. M. & G. 247, 42	
E.R. 547 . . . . .	760
2. DEFENCES OF THE TRUSTEE . . . . .	762
(a) That He Has Ceased To Be A Trustee . . . . .	762
Head v. Gould, [1898] 2 Ch. 250 . . . . .	762
(b) Consent of or Acquiescence by the Beneficiary . . . . .	766
Raby v. Ridehalgh (1855), 7 De G. M. & G.	
104, 44 E.R. 41 . . . . .	766
Note . . . . .	767
Note . . . . .	768
The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470, s.34 . . . . .	768
(c) Limitation of Actions and Laches . . . . .	768
Note . . . . .	768
Re Somerset, [1894] 1 Ch. 231 (C.A.) . . . . .	769
Soar v. Ashwell, [1893] 2 Q.B. 390 (C.A.) . . . . .	770
Note . . . . .	774
Martin v. Donaldson Securities Ltd. (1975),	
61 D.L.R. (3d) 518 (B.C.S.C.) . . . . .	775
3. RELIEF FOR TECHNICAL BREACHES OF TRUST . . . . .	778
The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1970, c.470, ss. 35, 50(3) . . . . .	778
National Trustees Co. of Australasia Ltd. v. General	
Finance Co. of Australasia Ltd., [1905] A.C.	
373 (P.C.) . . . . .	779
Note . . . . .	781
4. REMEDIES OF TRUSTEES INTER SE . . . . .	782
Note . . . . .	782
Chillingworth v. Chambers, [1896] 1 Ch. 685 (C.A.) . . . . .	782
MacDonald v. Hauer (1976), 72 D.L.R. (3d) 110	
(Sask. C.A.) . . . . .	785
5. CRIMINAL LIABILITY OF TRUSTEES . . . . .	793
Note . . . . .	793
6. PROPRIETARY REMEDIES . . . . .	793
Note . . . . .	793
References . . . . .	794
Re Hallett's Estate (1880), 13 Ch. D. 696 . . . . .	794
Note . . . . .	798
Note on Sinclair v. Brougham, [1914] A.C. 398 . . . . .	798
Re Diplock, [1948] 1 Ch. 465 (C.A.) . . . . .	799
Scott v. Scott (1962), 109 C.L.R. 649 (Aust. H.C.) . . . . .	809
Note . . . . .	811
McTaggart v. Boffo (1975), 64 D.L.R. (3d) 441	
(Ont. H.C.) . . . . .	811